#### **Year-end Results**

1. Table 1 below details the follow ups completed in 2017/18 with the original assurance rating and the re-assessed assurance rating. 100% of assurance issued after follow-up was re-assessed as amber, amber/green or green assurance showing improvement in the control environment as a result of internal audit work.

#### **KEY**

RED assurance = 0-50% controls operating/substantially operating
RED/AMBER assurance = 51-60% controls operating/substantially operating
AMBER assurance = 61-70% controls operating/substantially operating
AMBER/GREEN assurance = 71-80% controls operating/substantially operating
GREEN assurance = 81-100% controls operating/substantially operating

(D) = Downgraded assurance ratings based on number of high risk recommendations made (with the agreement of the Head of Internal Audit)

Table 1 - Follow Ups completed in 2017/18

Review	Audit Coverage	Original Assurance Rating	Follow Up Assurance Rating
IT Change Management	To review the design and operating effectiveness of key controls in place for processing IT changes, including emergency maintenance and patches, relating to infrastructure and applications within the production environment	AMBER 67% OP 22% PO	GREEN 100% OP
Weald Rise Governance & Financial Controls	To review the adequacy, application and effectiveness of the systems in place to control schools' delegated and standards fund income and expenditure and to assess the level of compliance with Financial Regulations/ Financial Procedure Rules and Contract Procedure Rules.	AMBER 70% OP 11% SO	GREEN 94% OP 5% SO

Review	Audit Coverage	Original Assurance Rating	Follow Up A Rating	Assurance
Scared Heart Governance & Financial Controls	To review the adequacy, application and effectiveness of the systems in place to control schools' delegated and standards fund income and expenditure and to assess the level of compliance with Financial Regulations/ Financial Procedure Rules and Contract Procedure Rules.	AMBER 55% OP 16% SO	GRI 95% 5%	OP
Kingsley Governing Body Key Decisions	To review the effectiveness of the Governing Body decision making process to ensure that key decisions are made, recorded clearly and that adequate information has been provided to make the decision.	AMBER 50% Key decisions made appropriately and recorded clearly in minutes plus a further 20% made appropriately	GRE 1 REC 1 P/T	CIMP
Grange HR Policies & Procedures	To ensure that schools have appropriate policies and procedures in place and implement them.	14 Recommendations made and all agreed for implementation	AMBER 6 RECS IMP 4 P/T IMP	GREEN 4 PLANNED
Norbury SIMS Personnel	to ensure that robust controls are in place in schools for the accuracy of the processing of Payroll through the SIMS Personnel system and to prevent or detect fraud.	12 Recommendations made 10 agreed for implementation	AMBER 9 RECS IMP 2 P/T IMP	GREEN 1 NOT PLANNED
Glebe SIMS Personnel	To ensure that robust controls are in place in schools for the accuracy of the processing of Payroll through the SIMS Personnel system and to prevent or detect fraud.	15 Recommendations made and all agreed for implementation	GRE 14 REC 1 NOT P	CS IMP
Grimsdyke HR policies & Procedures	To ensure that schools have appropriate policies and procedures in place and implement them.	16 Recommendations made and all agreed for implementation	GRE 8 REC 7 RECS 1 REC II	S IMP P/T IMP N PROG
Whitmore SIMS Personnel	To ensure that robust controls are in place in schools for the accuracy of the processing of Payroll through the SIMS Personnel system and to prevent or detect fraud	6 Recommendations made 4 agreed fully, 2 partially	GRI ALL RE	

Review	Audit Coverage	Original Assurance Rating	Follow Up Assurance Rating
Pinner Park SIMS Personnel	To ensure that robust controls are in place in schools for the accuracy of the processing of Payroll through the SIMS Personnel system and to prevent or detect fraud.	made and all agreed for	GREEN 100% OP
Shaftsbury HR Policies & Procedures	To ensure that schools have appropriate policies and procedures in place and implement them.	20 Recommendations made and all agreed for implementation	GREEN 100% OP

# Table 2 – Follow ups completed in 2017/18 which had a 2<sup>nd</sup> follow up

2. In 2017/18 there were two reviews which required a second follow up. For Planning Enforcement the level of implementation at the first follow up was not satisfactory (i.e. it was lower than an Amber assurance rating) and therefore required a second follow up to be undertaken. For Personal Budgets Paypal & Reconciliations a second follow up was requested by the Director to monitor the implementation of recommendations.

Review	Audit Coverage	Original Assurance Rating		1 <sup>st</sup> Follow Up Assurance Rating		2 <sup>nd</sup> Follow Up Rating	Assurance
Planning Enforcement Investigation – 2 <sup>nd</sup> Follow Up	Investigation into allegations of bribery and corruption for which there was insufficient evidence. However weaknesses in control were identified.	REI 16 Recomme		RED 38% Implemented	AMBER 19% Substantially	GRE 88 Implen	%
Personal Budgets PayPal & Reconciliations	To ensure adequacy, application and effectiveness of controls in place for the use of PayPal in relation to My Community ePurse (MyCep) and reconciliations undertaken of FWI, SAP and PayPal.	RED 43% O	AMBER 14% SO	AMB 52% 14%	5 O	AMBER 54% OP	GREEN 19% SO

3. Table 2 below details all the final reports issued in 2017/18 from the 2016/17 audit plan with the report assurance rating.

Table 2 – 2016/17 Plan Final Reports issued + followed up progress in 2017/18

Review	Audit Coverage	Assurance Rating		Follow-up
HBPL Service Charging +HBPL Ltd Governance	To review the governance arrangements for the HBPL Ltd and the charging arrangements for the HBPL Service.	AMBER 69% O	GREEN 9% SO	GREEN 96% OP 4% SO
NRPF	To ensure timely identification and assessment of NRPF cases enabling the allocation of only appropriate funds that are fully accountable.	RED 20% O	AMBER 40% SO	GREEN 80% OP 5% SO
Help2Let	To review the adequacy and application of controls in place for the Help2Let Scheme to minimise the risk of fraud.	RED 38% O	AMBER 19% SO	In progress
Emergency / Temporary Accommodation	To review adequacy and application of controls in place for applicants in emergency / temporary accommodation to minimise the risk of fraud.	AMBER 63% O	GREEN 11% SO	GREEN 84% OP 5% SO
IT Contract Management	To ensure that effective contract management is in place for the IT Contract with Sopra Steria (SSL), that services are obtained in accordance with the contract and that value for money is achieved.	AMBER 58% O	GREEN 29% SO (D)	GREEN 79% OP 13% SO

#### **APPENDIX 1**

Headteacher – Manipulation of Data	Investigation into concerns raised regarding inflation of Free School Meal data, the recording of English as a second language, results of 2015 SATS, disposal of equipment, collection of charity monies, running of the Saturday School, 2 children attending the school whilst not on the school roll.	have been significant levels of data manipulation resulting in artificially inflated numbers in the	
Housing Benefit Fraud Risk – Revised Report	To learn lessons from the current fraud case by reviewing controls in place to specifically assess whether they are effective to minimise the risk of internal fraud.	RED 57% O 13% SO (D)	In progress

4. Table 3 below details the completed assurance report reviews issued in 2017/18 from the 2017/18 Plan and the assurance rating.

Table 3 – 2017/18 Revised Plan Completed Assurance Report Reviews

Review	Audit Coverage	Assurance Rating Follow-up Due
Business Rates	Key control review	AMBER 88% O 8% SO (D) 91% OP 9% SO
Capital Expenditure	Key control review	GREEN GREEN 65%O 100% OP 26% SO

Review	Audit Coverage	Assurance	Rating	Follow-up Due		
Welldon Park Primary School Governance and Financial Controls Review	Review the adequacy, application and effectiveness of the systems in place to control schools delegated and standards fund budget and to assess the level of compliance with FR and CPR.	RED 34% O 29% SO (D)				In draft
Welldon Park Primary School Teaching Assistants Report (Emerging Risk)	To investigate the payments to Teaching Assistants for providing cover for teachers and the methods of payments both historic and pending.	RE	ĒD	In draft		
FB60	Review the use and compliance with agreed procedures	GREEN 30% O 60% SO		N/A		
Multi-Agency Safeguarding Hub (MASH)	The objective is to review the effective functioning of the Harrow's Multi Agency Safeguarding Hub (MASH) and its adherence to the five core elements.	GREEN 77% O 18% SO		N/A		
Harrow Arts Centre	The objective is to assess the financial and operational management of the Arts Centre and all its activities.	AMBER 58% O 15% SO		July 2018		
Contract Management	The objective is to ensure that effective contract management was in place for the Northgate – Revenues & Benefits Third Party Support Services	GREEN 76% O 7% SO		N/A		
Council Tax – Severely Mentally Impaired (SMI) Exemption	The objective is to review of the adequacy, application and effectiveness of the internal controls in place to prevent fraud within Council Tax Exemption for the Severely Mentally Impaired (SMI).	AMBER 55% O 9% SO		In draft		

Review	Audit Coverage	Assurance	Rating	Follow-up Due
Regeneration Programme - Procurement	The objective is to review revenue and capital procurement (including land deals) within the Regeneration Programme to assess the adequacy application and effectiveness of controls in place and ensure compliance with EU Procurement Laws and the Council's Internal Procedures (Contract Procedure Rules and Financial Regulations).	RED 42% O	AMBER 11% SO	September 2018
Schools Pay Policy / Performance Management processes – HR report	The objective is to gain assurance that schools have appropriate Pay Policies in place that comply with the School Teachers Pay and Conditions Document and that performance management decisions are reflected in the pay increases specifically for the Senior Management Team and that starter salaries are appropriately determined and authorised.	<b>AMBER</b> 67% O	GREEN 22% SO (D)	In draft
Kenmore Park Infants Pay Policy / Performance Management processes	The objective is to gain assurance that schools have appropriate Pay Policies in place that comply with the School Teachers Pay and Conditions Document and that performance management decisions are reflected in the pay increases specifically for the Senior Management Team and that starter salaries are appropriately determined and authorised.	AMBER 70% O	GREEN 27% SO (D)	December 2018

Review	Audit Coverage	Assurance	Rating	Follow-up Due
Woodlands Infants Pay Policy / Performance Management processes	The objective is to gain assurance that schools have appropriate Pay Policies in place that comply with the School Teachers Pay and Conditions Document and that performance management decisions are reflected in the pay increases specifically for the Senior Management Team and that starter salaries are appropriately determined and authorised.	AMBER 69% O 12% SO (D)		In draft
St Anselm's Catholic Primary Infants Pay Policy / Performance Management processes	The objective is to gain assurance that schools have appropriate Pay Policies in place that comply with the School Teachers Pay and Conditions Document and that performance management decisions are reflected in the pay increases specifically for the Senior Management Team and that starter salaries are appropriately determined and authorised.	AMBER 66% O	GREEN 26% SO (D)	In draft
Camrose Primary Infants Pay Policy / Performance Management processes	The objective is to gain assurance that schools have appropriate Pay Policies in place that comply with the School Teachers Pay and Conditions Document and that performance management decisions are reflected in the pay increases specifically for the Senior Management Team and that starter salaries are appropriately determined and authorised.	AMBER 63% O	GREEN 25%SO (D)	In draft

Review	Audit Coverage	Assurance Rating		Follow-up Due		
Kenmore Park Junior Infants Pay Policy / Performance Management processes	The objective is to gain assurance that schools have appropriate Pay Policies in place that comply with the School Teachers Pay and Conditions Document and that performance management decisions are reflected in the pay increases specifically for the Senior Management Team and that starter salaries are appropriately determined and authorised	AMBER 61% O	GREEN 27% SO	December 2018		
Hillview Nursery - Schools Budget Management	The objective is to review the adequacy, application and effectiveness of the systems in place for the preparation, monitoring and control of school devolved budgets.	GREEN 86% O 14% SO		86% O		In draft
Helix Centre – Schools Budget Management	The objective is to review the adequacy, application and effectiveness of the systems in place for the preparation, monitoring and control of school devolved budgets.	AMBER 53% O 7% SO		In draft		
Adult Residential Care	The audit objective is to review the commissioning of Adult Residential Care including assessments, allocations, payments and reviews.	RED 38% O 17% SO (D)		In draft		
Personal Budgets	To review the cash Personal Budgets system and the effectiveness of the controls in place to ensure clients have been appropriately financially assessed, that the spend is being monitored, any surplus is being recovered and a review of the care package takes place to minimise the risk of fraud and overpayment/loss to the authority.	RED 22% O 20% SO		22% O 20% SO		AMBER 42% O 22% SO

Review	Audit Coverage	Assurance	Rating	Follow-up Due
Commercialisation	To determine if the key aims and objectives of the Commercialisation Strategy are being met, that governance is adequate and lessons are learnt.	RED 39% O 11% SO		Fieldwork Complete
Special Needs Transport	To confirm that savings as detailed within the Business Case of Special Needs Transport (SNT) service are being achieved and that People Services are engaged in the Commissioning process to ensure cost effective delivery.	RE 13%		Fieldwork Complete
Waste – Landfill, Recycling & Weighbridge	To review the waste disposal arrangement and to ensure that waste is disposed off as per the statutory requirements and there are robust controls in place to protect the Council from Serious Organised crime following report from the Home Office. To review controls over income collection for weighbridge including out of borough and any other income.	37% O	AMBER 16% SO	Fieldwork Complete
Major Works – Leaseholders	To review that where major works are carried out to Council Housing stock, leaseholders are consulted and relevant charges to leaseholders are apportioned correctly and fully recovered in accordance with the lease.	81% O (D)	GREEN	Fieldwork Complete

**APPENDIX 1** 

5. Table 4 below shows reports issued during the year as a result of emerging risks or suspected financial irregularities (SFIs) that were not specified in the plan.

Table 4 – 2017/18 Emerging Risk/Audit Investigation reports

Review	Audit Coverage	Assurance
Housing Benefits New Claims Fraud	A referral was made by the Housing Benefits Team on the 11 July 2017 to the Corporate Anti Fraud Team (CAFT) regarding the discovery of fraudulent new claims being made, the referral was made due to the nature and number of fraud claims identified to ensure controls are adequate. This was then passed by CAFT to Internal Audit so that the paperwork on the benefit claims to establish if any lessons can be learned from the documents provided. This was also referred to the DWP who are currently investigating.	Of the 23 claims identified as fraudulent new claims, 14 had been assessed and put into payment totalling £26,753.70 paid. A total of 7 recommendations have been made to address weaknesses identified.
Family Information Service	A referral was made to the Head of Internal Audit & Corporate Anti-Fraud on the 10 November 2017 by the Corporate Director People in relation to a concern that payments had been made by the Early Years Team to incorrect individuals and Internal Audit were asked to investigate this.	Payments were made to incorrect SAP vendors totalling £59,031.45; this was caused by human error and a lack of internal check and does not appear to have been fraudulent or negligent. A total of £14,047.55 remains outstanding and a formal referral to CAFT has been made in relation to the payee who has only returned part of the money as it is a wrongful retention of a credit.
Planning Flexi Time	A concern was raised by the Head of Development Management and Building Control (SS) regarding the accuracy of time recording by the Vetting Team.	It has not been possible to prove one way or another the accuracy of the team's flexi/time records using evidence from other Council systems. No assurance is currently provided by the team's line managers that flexi/time sheets are accurate and that flexible working arrangements are operating in line with an agreed structure. There appears to be a lack of management compliance with the Council's Policies on Flexible Working and Flexi-time.

6. Table 5 details the Audit Briefing Notes issued as part of the 2017/18 Internal Audit Revised Plan

Table 5 – 2017/18 Revised Plan Audit Briefing Notes

Review	Audit Coverage	Assurance
Parking Ticket Overpayments	An anonymous enquiry was sent to the Corporate Director of Resources & Commercial on the 19 August 2017 in relation to Parking Fines (PCNs) which was subsequently referred to the Head of Internal Audit & Corporate Anti-Fraud for investigation.	There is no procedure in place in relation to identifying and refunding parking overpayments other than when a motorist contacts and asks for a refund. There are improvements which could be made to processes/information for the motorist which potentially could help to minimise the level of overpayments made. A check could not be undertaken to verify the concern in relation to the 10 minute grace period as it was not possible to run a report. An issue was identified in relation to road names not being distinguishable from each other and tickets being issued for the wrong location (this is in the process of being resolved). There are also issues surrounding the quality of output i.e. standard of letter responses not always clear, tasks not being actioned, evidence not being checked, inadequate notes on the system to enable a proper audit trail and in 1 instance a ticket being cancelled which should not have been. There is a delay in dealing with emails, which has been identified by management and a longer term solution is being looked into. There is a lack of permanent budget to support the service due to increased levels of tickets issued which has caused an overspend each year. Also there has been no recent formal training in place for the back office staff.

Review	Audit Coverage	Assurance			
Belmont Fraud Risk in Schools	The objective is to raise the level of				
Cedars Manor Fraud Risk in	fraud awareness in schools and how to	Workshops were well received by all the schools.			
Schools	reduce the risk of fraud occurring	Documentation as part of and with the report would			
Elmgrove Primary Fraud Risk in	through the application of appropriate	provide the schools with a mechanism to explore			
Schools	preventative controls, to raise	different areas of fraud risk with their staff and potentially			
Pinner Park Junior Fraud Risk in	awareness of the type of detective	Governors.			
Schools	controls that can be used to help				
Priestmead Primary Fraud Risk in	identify fraud and how to refer any				
Schools	(potential or actual) fraud for further				
St George's Primary Fraud Risk	investigation.				
in Schools					
St John's CE Fraud Risk in					
Schools					
Stag Lane Junior Fraud Risk in					
Schools					
Whitchurch Primary Fraud Risk in					
Schools					
100 Homes	To provide assurance that properties	It can be shown that savings are being generated from			
	have been purchased in accordance	the 100 Homes Initiative however the 20% sample of the			
	with the agreed model, that probity can	40 homes currently let indicates the savings are not in			
	be demonstrated and that benefits of	line with the current model.			
	the project in terms of savings are				
	being realised.				

**APPENDIX 1** 

7. Table 6 below details the completed assurance non report reviews undertaken in 2017/18 from the 2017/18 Plan.

Table 6 – 2017/18 Revised Plan Completed Assurance Non Report Reviews in 2017/18

Review	Audit Coverage	Comments	
Housing Rents	Self assessment	GREEN assurance	
Corporate Accounts Payable (CAP)	Self assessment	GREEN assurance	
Corporate Accounts Receivable (CAR)	Self assessment	GREEN assurance	
Payroll	Self assessment	GREEN assurance	
Treasury Management	Self assessment	GREEN assurance	
Housing Benefits	Self assessment	GREEN assurance	
Council Tax	Self assessment	GREEN assurance	
Corporate Governance	Annual governance review, drafting AGS, AGS Action Plan	Complete –	
		'Reasonable	
		Assurance'	
Information Governance Board (IGB)	To ensure that the Council has effective polices &	Complete	
	management arrangements covering Information governance		
Risk Management	Q1 - 4 (2017/18) update of Corporate Risk Register	Complete	
Families First Grant	Testing and Grant certification	Complete	
Professional Advice	Advice on risk mitigation & control	Complete	
Liaison with External Audit	On-going liaison throughout the year	Complete	

#### **Performance Indicators**

8. Table 7 below outlines the four Internal Audit indicators agreed for the year, including the key indicator covering achievement of the IA annual plan and table 8 the one corporate audit indicator and the results achieved. These indicators cover performance on projects from the 2016/17 plan and the 2017/18 plan issued during the year.

Table 7 - Internal Audit Performance Indicator Results

	Performance Indicator	Target	Mid Year Result	Year End Result
1	Recommendations agreed for implementation	95%	100%	96%
2	Follow up undertaken	100%	71%	100%
3	Plan achieved for key control reviews	100%	100%	100%
4	Plan achieved overall (key indicator)	90%	42%	93%

#### **Analysis of Results**

9. All 4 (100%) performance targets have been met or exceeded. 2 of the performance targets has been exceeded and 2 have been fully met (as the target is 100% they cannot be exceeded). Whilst the plan achieved is shown at 93% this will increase to 99% once outstanding reports are issued.

**APPENDIX 1** 

Table 8 - Corporate Audit Indicators Results

	Performance Indicator	Target	Mid Year Result	Year End Result
1	Implementation of recommendations	90%	88% (expected to be 100%)	71% (expected to be 99%)

# **Analysis of Results**

10. The result for performance indicator 1 shows that whilst 71% of recommendations had been implemented at the time of follow-up a further 28% were part implemented/in progress or planned for implementation giving an expected implementation rate of 99% exceeding the 90% target.

Susan Dixson Head of Internal Audit 27/06/18